

Bibliography on Proving the Correctness of Computer Programs

Ralph L. London

Computer Sciences Department
University of Wisconsin

Preface and acknowledgements

As this bibliography shows, there is considerable research interest in the topic of proving the correctness of computer programs. Included in the bibliography are all published or unpublished papers, books, reports, theses, etc., known to me that are at all related to the topic. Material cited encompasses very abstract papers dealing with the transformation and equivalence of program schemata; proposals and methods for proving individual programs correct; papers proving the correctness of specific algorithms and programs; and work that has proofs as an incidental part of the paper. In other words, the range is from the very abstract to the very practical. An item is included unless it appeared obvious to me that it did not belong. Thus material of marginal relevance is included.

A complete citation was impossible to obtain for a few items. The best available information is given. An item is in the same language as that of the title, unless otherwise indicated at the end of a citation. Note that the contents of the Russian publication *Problemy Kibernetiki* appears in English translation as *Problems of Cybernetics*; similarly *Kibernetika* appears as *Cybernetics*. I would be most interested in learning of corrections and additional citations to update the bibliography.

This work was supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant GP-7069 and the Mathematics Research Center, United States Army, under Contract Number DA-31-124-ARO-D-462. The contributions of D. C. Cooper, J. W. de Bakker, D. I. Good, L. Green, Z. Manna, R. Milner, C. M. I. Rattray, C. S. Wells and D. Wood to compiling the bibliography are acknowledged without in any way holding them responsible for what has been included, excluded or omitted.

Abrahams, P. W., Machine verification of mathematical proof. sc. D. Thesis, Massachusetts Institute of Technology 1963; also *Mathematical Algorithms*, 1(2)(1966)11-32; 1(3)(1966)19-38; 2(1967)28-79; and 3(1968) 28-155.

APPENDIX

- Allen, F. E., Program optimization. *IBM research paper RC-1599*; see also *Annual review of automatic programming*, 5 (eds Halpern, M. I. & Shaw, C. J.). Oxford: Pergamon 1969.
- Ashcroft, E. A., Functional programs as axiomatic theories. *Centre for computing and automation report no. 9*. London: Imperial College. Undated.
- Baer, J. L., Graph models of computations in computer systems. *Department of engineering report no. 68-46*. University of California at Los Angeles 1968.
- Balzer, R. M., Studies concerning minimal time solutions to the firing squad synchronization problem. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1966.
- Balzer, R. M., An 8-state minimal time solution to the firing squad synchronization problem. *Information & Control*, 10 (1967) 22-42.
- Barron, D. W., Recursive techniques in programming. New York: American Elsevier 1968.
- Basu, S. K., Transformation of program schemes to standard forms. *IEEE Conference record of the ninth annual symposium on switching and automata theory*, pp. 99-105. New York: IEEE 1968.
- Basu, S. K., Transformation of program schemes to standard forms. *Technical report*. Carnegie-Mellon University 1968.
- Basu, S. K., On reduction of program schemes. *SIAM Journal on Applied Mathematics*, 16, (1968) 328-39.
- Best, S. F., A proof that a demonstration program works. *Decision Systems Inc. internal document PR-0516*, pp. 37-61. 1967.
- Block, H. D., The perceptron: a model for brain functioning, 1. *Reviews of Modern Physics*, 34 (1962) 123-35.
- Blum, E. K., Towards a theory of semantics and compilers for programming languages. *Ass. comput. Mach. Symposium on Theory of Computing*, 1969, pp. 217-27. Updated version in *J. comput. & system Sci.*, 3 (1969) 248-75.
- Bohm, C. & Jacopini, G., Flow diagrams, Turing machines and languages with only two formation rules. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, 9 (1966) 366-71; see also Cooper, D. C.
- Burstall, R. M., Semantics of assignment. *Machine Intelligence 2*, pp. 3-20 (eds Dale, E. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd 1968.
- Burstall, R. M., Proving properties of programs by structural induction. *Comput. J.*, 12 (1969) 41-8.
- Burstall, R. M. & Landin, P. J., Programs and their proofs: An algebraic approach. *Machine Intelligence 4*, pp. 17-43 (eds Meltzer, B. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1969.
- Caviness, B. F., On canonical forms and simplification. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1968.
- Chartres, B. A. & Florentin, J. J., A universal syntax-directed top-down analyzer. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.*, 15 (1968) 447-64.
- Cooper, D. C., The equivalence of certain computations. *Comput. J.*, 9 (1966) 45-52.

- Cooper, D. C., Mathematical proofs about computer programs. *Machine Intelligence 1*, pp. 17–28 (eds Collins, N.L. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd 1967.
- Cooper, D. C., Reduction of programs to a standard form by graph transformation. *Theory of graphs, international symposium, Rome, 1966*, pp. 57–68 (ed. Rosenstiehl, P.). New York: Gordon and Breach 1967.
- Cooper, D. C., Bohm and Jacopini's reduction of flow charts. Letter to editor, *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **10** (1967) 463, 473; *see also* Bohm, C. & Jacopini, G.
- Cooper, D. C., Some transformations and standard forms of graphs with applications to computer programs. *Machine Intelligence 2*, pp. 21–32 (eds Dale, E. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Oliver & Boyd 1968.
- Cooper, D. C., Program scheme equivalences and second order logic. *Machine Intelligence 4*, pp. 3–15 (eds Meltzer, B. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1969.
- Cooper, D. C., Program schemes, programs and logic. *Computation Services Department Memorandum No. 6*. University College of Swansea 1969. (Presented at Journées d'études sur l'analyse syntaxique, Fontainebleau, France, March 1969.)
- de Bakker, J. W., Axiomatics of simple assignment statements. *Mathematical Centre Tracts 94*. Amsterdam: Mathematisch Centrum 1968.
- de Bakker, J. W., Semantics of programming languages. *Advances in Information Systems Science*, **2**, pp. 173–227 (ed. Tou, J. T.). New York & London: Plenum Press 1969.
- Dijkstra, E. W., Solution of a problem in concurrent programming control. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **8** (1965) 569; *see also* Knuth, D. E.
- Dijkstra, E. W., Co-operating sequential processes. *Programming Languages*, pp. 43–112 (ed. Genuys, F.). London and New York: Academic Press 1968.
- Dijkstra, E. W., A constructive approach to the problem of program correctness, *B.I.T.*, **8** (1968) 174–86.
- Dijkstra, E. W., Towards correct programming, EWD 241. Eindhoven: Mathematics Department, Technological University 1968.
- Dijkstra, E. W., Goto statement considered harmful. Letter to Editor, *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **11** (1968) 147–8. Reply, *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **11** (1968) 538, 541; *see also* Rice, J. R.
- Dijkstra, E. W., The structure of the 'THE' multiprogramming system. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **11** (1968) 341–6.
- Di Paola, R. A., A survey of Soviet work in the theory of computer programming. *Rand Corporation Memorandum RM-5424-PR* 1967.
- Earley, J. C., Generating a recognizer for a BNF grammar. *Technical Report*. Carnegie-Mellon University 1965.
- Elgot, C. C., Abstract algorithms and diagram closure. *Programming Languages*, pp. 1–42 (ed. Genuys, F.). London and New York: Academic Press 1968.

APPENDIX

- Engeler, E., Algorithmic properties of structures. *Mathematical Systems Theory*, 1 (1967) 183-95.
- Engeler, E., *Formal Languages, Automata and Structures*. Chicago: Markham Publishing 1968.
- Engeler, E., *Approximation by machines*. Zürich: Forschungsinstitut für Mathematik, ETH 1969.
- Engeler, E., *Algorithmic approximations*. Zürich: Forschungsinstitut für Mathematik, ETH, undated.
- Engeler, E., Proof theory and the accuracy of computations (to appear).
- Ershov, A. P., Operator algorithms, I. *Problems of Cybernetics* 3, pp. 697-763 (trans. Kiss, G. R.). New York: Pergamon Press 1962.
- Ershov, A. P., Operator algorithms, II (Basic programming constructions). *Problems of Cybernetics* 8, pp. 377-407. Washington D.C.: Joint publications research service, Department of Commerce 1964.
- Ershov, A. P., Operator algorithms, III (On the operator schemes of Yanov). *Problemy Kibernetiki* 20, pp. 181-200. Moscow: Nauka 1967 (Russian). Also *Problems of Cybernetics* (in press).
- Ershov, A. P. & Lyapunov, A. A., On the formalization of the notion of program. *Kibernetika (Kiev)*, 5 (1967) 40-57 (Russian).
- Evans, A. Jr., Syntax analysis by a production language. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1965.
- Fels, E. M., Kaluzhnin graphs and Yanov writs. *Logik und Logikkalkul*, pp. 159-78 (eds Kasbauer, M. & von Kutschera, F.). Freiburg/Munchen: Verlag Karl Alber 1962.
- Florentin, J. J., Language definition and computer validation. *Machine Intelligence* 3, pp. 33-41 (ed. Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1968.
- Floyd, R. W., Assigning meanings to programs. *Proceedings of a Symposium in Applied Mathematics, Vol. 19 - Mathematical Aspects of Computer Science*, pp. 19-32 (ed. Schwartz, J. T.). Providence, Rhode Island: American Mathematical Society 1967.
- Floyd, R. W., The verifying compiler. *Computer Science Research Review*, pp. 18-19. Carnegie-Mellon University 1967.
- Glebov, N. I., O stroenii klassa r-kriteriev zkvivalentnosti. *Problemy Kibernetiki*, 9. Moskva: Fizmatgiz 1962.
- Glebov, N. I., On algebraic equivalence of subsets of categories. *Problems of Cybernetics*, 8, pp. 358-76. Washington, D.C.: Joint Publications Research Service, Department of Commerce 1964.
- Glushkov, V. M., Automata theory and formal microprogram transformations. *Cybernetics*, 1 (1965) 1-8.
- Goldstine, H. H. & von Neumann, J., Planning and coding problems for an electronic computer instrument, Part 2, Vols. 1-3. *John von Neumann, Collected Works Vol. 5*, pp. 80-235 (ed. Taub, A. H.). New York: Pergamon Press 1963. (See especially p. 92 for the use of an assertion box.)

- Good, D. I., Toward the realization of a program proving system. Ph.D. Thesis, to be submitted to the University of Wisconsin 1970.
- Good, D. I. & London, R. L., Interval arithmetic for the Burroughs B5500: Four ALGOL procedures and proofs of their correctness. *Computer Sciences Technical Report No. 26*. University of Wisconsin 1968.
- Good, D. I. & London, R. L., Computer interval arithmetic: Definition and proof of correct implementation. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.* (to appear).
- Green, C., Application of theorem proving to problem solving. *Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pp. 219–39 (eds Walker, D. E. & Norton, L. M.). New York: ACM 1969.
- Habermann, A. N., On the harmonious co-operation of abstract machines. Doctoral Thesis. Technological University, Eindhoven, The Netherlands, 1967.
- Habermann, A. N., Prevention of system deadlocks. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **12** (1969) 373–7, 385.
- Hoare, C. A. R., Set manipulation. *ALGOL Bulletin* **27** (1968) 29–37.
- Hoare, C. A. R., An axiomatic basis of computer programming. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **12** (1969) 576–80, 583.
- Hoare, C. A. R., Proof of programs: Partition and find. Department of Computer Science, The Queens University of Belfast 1969.
- Hoare, C. A. R., Notes on a theory of types and data structuring, *WG.2.2 Paper* 1969.
- Ianov, Y. I., On the equivalence and transformation of program schemes. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **1** (1958) 8–12.
- Ianov, Y. I., On matrix program schemes. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **1** (1958) 3–6.
- Ianov, Y. I., The logical schemes of algorithms. *Problems of Cybernetics*, **1**, pp. 82–140 (trans. Nadler, M. *et al.*). New York: Pergamon Press 1960.
- Ianov, Y. I., On transformations of program flow-diagrams. Joint Publications Research Service, 6868. Office of Technical Services 1962.
- Ianov, Y. I., On local transformation of algorithm schemes. *Problemy Kibernetiki*, **20**. Moscow: Nauka 1967 (Russian).
- Igarashi, S., On the logical schemes of algorithms. *Information Processing in Japan*, **3** (1963) 12–18.
- Igarashi, S., A formalization of the descriptions of languages and the related problems in a Gentzen-type formal system. *Research Notes*, Series 3, No. 80. Research Association of Applied Geometry 1964. (See especially pp. 28–9.)
- Igarashi, S., An axiomatic approach to the equivalence problems of algorithms with applications. Ph.D. Thesis. University of Tokyo 1964; also *Report of the Computer Centre, University of Tokyo*, **1** (1968) 1–101.
- Igarashi, S., On the equivalence of programs represented by ALGOL-like statements. *Report of the Computer Centre, University of Tokyo*, **1** (1968), 103–18.

APPENDIX

- Igarashi, S., Comments on the formal treatment of types including sets. *ALGOL Bulletin*, 29 (1968) 12-15.
- Igarashi, S., Equivalence-theoretical treatment of verification conditions, *WG.2.2 (under TC2 of IFIP) Meeting*. Vienna, April 1969.
- Ito, T., Some formal properties of a class of non-deterministic program schemata. *IEEE Conference Record of the Ninth Annual Symposium on Switching and Automata Theory*, pp. 85-98. New York: IEEE 1968.
- Ito, T., Notes on theory of computation and pattern recognition. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 61*. Stanford University 1968.
- Iturriaga, R., Contributions to mechanical mathematics. Ph.D. Thesis, Carnegie-Mellon University 1967.
- Iverson, K. E., *A Programming Language*. New York: John Wiley and Sons 1962.
- Kaluzhnin, L. A., Algorithmization of mathematical problems. *Problems of Cybernetics*, 2, pp. 371-91 (trans. Kiss, G. R.). New York: Pergamon Press 1961.
- Kaplan, D. M., Correctness of a compiler for ALGOL-like programs. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 48*. Stanford University 1967.
- Kaplan, D. M., Some completeness results in the mathematical theory of computation. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.*, 15 (1968) 124-34.
- Kaplan, D. M., A formal theory concerning the equivalence of algorithms. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 59*. Stanford University 1968.
- Kaplan, D. M., The formal theoretic analysis of strong equivalence for elemental programs. Ph.D. Thesis. Stanford University 1968; also *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 60*. Stanford University 1968.
- Kaplan, D. M., Regular expressions and the equivalence of programs. *J. comput. & sys. Sci.*, 3 (1969) 361-86.
- Kaplan, D. M., Recursion induction applied to generalized flowcharts. *Proc. 24th Nat. Ass. comput. Mach. Conf.*, pp. 491-504. New York: ACM 1969.
- Karp, R. M., Some applications of logical syntax to digital computer programming. Ph.D. Thesis. Harvard University 1959.
- Karp, R. M., A note on the application of graph theory to digital computer programming. *Information and Control*, 3 (1960) 179-90.
- Karp, R. M. & Miller, R. E., Properties of a model for parallel computations: Determinancy, termination, queuing. *SIAM Journal on Applied Mathematics*, 14 (1966) 1390-1411.
- Karp, R. M. & Miller, R. E., Parallel program schemata: A mathematical model for parallel computation. *IEEE Conference Record of the Eighth Annual Symposium on Switching Theory and Automata Theory*, pp. 55-61. New York: IEEE 1967
- Karp, R. M. & Miller, R. E., Parallel program schemata. *J. comput. & sys. Sci.*, 3 (1969) 147-95.
- King, J. C., A program verifier. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1969.

- Knuth, D. E., Additional comments on a problem in concurrent programming control. Letter to Editor, *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, 9 (1966) 321–2; see also Dijkstra, E. W.
- Knuth, D. E., *The art of computer programming, Vol. 1 – Fundamental Algorithms*, pp. 14–20, 318–19. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley 1968; *Vol. 2 – Seminumerical Algorithms*, pp. 245, 246, 508, 510. Addison-Wesley 1969.
- Knuth, D. E., Semantics of context-free languages. *Mathematical Systems Theory*, 2 (1968) 127–45.
- Krinitzkiy, N. A., Ravnosilnye preobrazovaniya logicheskikh skhem. Avtoreferat Dissertatsii. MGU, Moskva 1959.
- Kunze, J., Selektive Graphschemata. *Zeitschrift für Mathematische Logik und Grundlagen der Mathematik*, 13 (1967) 101–22.
- Laski, J. G., Sets and other types. *ALGOL Bulletin* 27 (1968) 41–8.
- Levy, S. & Paull, M. C., An algebra with applications to sorting algorithms. *Proceedings of the Third Annual Princeton Conference on Information Sciences and Systems* (1969) 286–91. Also *RCA Technical Report PTR-2176*. 1969.
- London, R. L., A computer program for discovering and proving sequential recognition rules for well-formed formulas defined by a Backus normal form grammar. Ph. D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1964.
- London, R. L., A computer program for discovering and proving recognition rules for Backus normal form grammars. *Proc. 19th Nat. Ass. comput. Mach. Conf.* pp. A1.3–1 to A1.3–7. New York: ACM 1964.
- London, R. L., Correctness of the ALGOL procedure Askforhand. *Computer Sciences Technical Report No. 50*. University of Wisconsin 1968.
- London, R. L., Computer programs can be proved correct. *Proceedings of Fourth Systems Symposium – Formal Systems and Non-numerical Problem Solving by Computers* (eds. Banerji, R. B. & Mesarovic, M. D.). Springer-Verlag (in press).
- London, R. L., Proof of algorithms: A new kind of certification (Certification of Algorithm 245 Treesort 3). *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.* (to appear).
- London, R. L., Proving programs correct: Some techniques and examples. In press.
- London, R. L. & Halton, J. H., Proofs of algorithms for asymptotic series. *Computer Sciences Technical Report No. 54A*. University of Wisconsin 1969.
- London, R. L. & Wasserman, A. I., The anatomy of an ALGOL procedure. *Computer Sciences Technical Report No. 5*. University of Wisconsin 1967.
- Lucas, P., Two constructive realizations of the block concept and their equivalence. *Technical Report 25.085*. Vienna: IBM Laboratory 1968.
- Luckham, D. C., Investigation of the theory of algorithms with emphasis on program simplification. *Bolt, Beranek and Newman Inc., Report No. 1225*. 1965.

APPENDIX

- Luckham, D. C. & Park, D. M. R., The undecidability of the equivalence problem for program schemata. *Bolt, Beranek and Newman Inc., Report No. 1141*. 1964.
- Luckham, D. C., Park, D. M. R. & Paterson, M. S., *On formalized computer programs*. Programming Research Group, Oxford University 1967.
- Lyapunov, A. A., Logical schemes of programs. *Problems of Cybernetics Vol. 1*, pp. 48–81. (trans. Nadler, M. *et al.*). New York: Pergamon 1960.
- McCarthy, J., Recursive functions of symbolic expressions and their computations by machine, Part 1. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, 3 (1960) 184–95.
- McCarthy, J., Computer programs for checking mathematical proofs. *Proceedings of Symposia in Pure Mathematics, Vol. 5 – Recursive Function Theory*, pp. 219–27 (ed. Dekker, J. C. E.). Providence, Rhode Island: American Mathematical Society 1962.
- McCarthy, J., Towards a mathematical science of computation. *Information processing; Proceedings of IFIP Congress 62*, pp. 21–8 (ed. Popplewell, C. M.). Amsterdam: North Holland 1963.
- McCarthy, J., A basis for a mathematical theory of computation. *Computer Programming and Formal Systems*, pp. 33–70 (eds Braffort, P. & Hirschberg, D.). Amsterdam: North Holland 1963. Also *Proceedings of the Western Joint Computer Conference*, pp. 225–38. New York: Spartan Books 1961.
- McCarthy, J., Problems in the theory of computation. *Proceedings of IFIP Congress 65*, pp. 219–22 (ed. Kalenich, W.). Washington, D. C.: Spartan Books Inc. 1965.
- McCarthy, J., A formal description of a subset of ALGOL. *Formal Language Description Languages for Computer Programming*, pp. 1–12 (ed. Steel, T. B., Jr.). Amsterdam: North Holland 1966.
- McCarthy, J. (ed.), *Papers in Theory of Computation* (Reprinted papers). Stanford University 1966.
- McCarthy, J. & Hayes, P. J., Some philosophical problems from the standpoint of artificial intelligence. *Machine Intelligence 4*, pp. 463–502 (see especially pp. 481–3) (eds Meltzer, B. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1969.
- McCarthy, J. & Painter J. A., Correctness of a compiler for arithmetic expressions. *Proceedings of a Symposium in Applied Mathematics, Vol. 19 – Mathematical Aspects of Computer Science*, pp. 33–41 (ed. Schwartz, J. T.). Providence, Rhode Island: American Mathematical Society 1967.
- Manna, Z., Termination of algorithms. Ph. D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1968.
- Manna, Z., The correctness problem of computer programs. *Computer Science Research Review*, pp. 34–6. Carnegie-Mellon University 1968.
- Manna, Z., Formalization of properties of program. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 64*. Stanford University 1968.

- Manna, Z., Properties of programs and the first-order predicate calculus. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **16** (1969) 244–55.
- Manna, Z., The correctness of programs. *J. comput. & sys. Sci.*, **3** (1969) 119–27.
- Manna, Z. & Pnueli, A., The validity problem of the 91-function. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 68*. Stanford University 1968.
- Manna, Z. & Pnueli, A., Formalization of properties of recursively defined functions. *Ass. comput. Mach. Symposium on Theory of Computing*, pp. 201–10. New York: ACM 1969.
- Markov, A. A., *Theory of Algorithms* (trans. Schorr-Kon, J. J.). No. OTS 60–51085. U.S. Department of Commerce, Office of Technical Services 1961.
- Martynyuk, V. V., Ob analize grafa perekhodov dlya operatornoy skhemy. *Zhurnal Vychislitelnoy Matematiki I Matematicheskoy Fiziki*, **5** (1965) Moskva.
- Martynyuk, V. V., O proverke zhivalentnosti operatornykh skhem. *Tezisy Kratkikh Nauchnykh Soobshcheniy Mezhdunarodnomu Kongressu Matematikov 1966 G.* (Seksiya 14). Moskva 1966.
- Maurer, W. D., A theory of computer instructions. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **13** (1966) 226–35.
- Milner, R., A partial decision procedure for $P \not\equiv Q$, where P, Q are program schemes with non-intersecting loops. *Computation Services Department Memorandum No. 1*. University College of Swansea, Wales 1968.
- Milner, R., Some equivalence relations on program schemes. *Computation Services Department Memorandum No. 5*. University College of Swansea, Wales 1969.
- Munteanu, E., Metod analiva graf-skhemnykh algorifmov. *Mathematica*, **5** (28) (1965) 2.
- Munteanu, E., Analyse logique des algorithms (1). *Mathematica*, **9** (32) (1967) 111–28.
- Naur, P., Proof of algorithms by general snapshots. *B.I.T.*, **6** (1966) 310–16.
- Nievergelt, J. & Irland, M. I., NUCLEOL as a formal system. Presented at *Sigplan Symposium on programming language definition*. 1969.
- Nikitin, A. S., A class of equivalent transformations of operator schemes, 1. *Cybernetics*, **2** (1966) 51–7.
- Oettinger, A. G., Automatic syntax analysis and the pushdown store. *Proceedings of a Symposium in Applied Mathematics, Vol. 12 – Structure of Language and its Mathematical Aspects*, pp. 104–29 (ed. Jakobson, R.). Providence, Rhode Island: American Mathematical Society 1961.
- Orgass, R. J., A mathematical theory of computing machine structure and programming. Ph.D. Thesis. Yale University 1967. Also *IBM Research Paper RC-1863*. 1967.
- Orgass, R. J., Problems in the theory of programming. *IBM Research Paper RC-2236/8* 1967.

APPENDIX

- Orgass, R. J., Some results concerning proofs of statements about programs. *IBM Research Paper RC-2324*. 1969.
- Orgass, R. J. & Fitch, F. B., A theory of programming languages. *IBM Research Paper RC-1979*. 1967.
- Orgass, R. J. & Fitch, F. B., A theory of computing machines. *Studium Generale*, **22** (1969) 83-104; 113-36.
- Painter, J. A., Semantic correctness of a compiler for an ALGOL-like language. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 44*. Stanford University 1967; also Ph.D. Thesis. Stanford University 1967.
- Paterson, M. S., Equivalence problems in a model of computation. Ph.D. Thesis. University of Cambridge 1967.
- Paterson, M. S., Program schemata. *Machine Intelligence 3*, pp. 18-31 (ed. Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1968.
- Perlis, A. J., Unpublished notes on proofs of three numeric algorithms. University of Michigan, Summer Session 1963.
- Podlovchenko, R. I., Primer ispolzovaniya preobrazovaniy logicheskikh skhem programm. *Problemy Kibernetiki*, **11**. Moskva: Fizmatgiz 1963.
- Prosser, R. T., Applications of Boolean matrices to the analysis of flow diagrams. *Proceedings of the Eastern Joint Computer Conference*, pp. 133-8. New York: Spartan Books 1959.
- Rechard, O. W. & Stark, R. H., Equivalence of two algorithms for Cooper's generalized factorial function. *Comput. J.*, **12** (1969) 33-7.
- Rennie, M. K., Theory of procedures: 1, simple conditionals. *Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic*, **10** (1969) 97-112. Abstract only in *Journal of Symbolic Logic*, **32** (1967) 577.
- Rice, J. R., The goto statement reconsidered. Letter to Editor, *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **11** (1968) 538. See also Dijkstra, E. W.
- Rosser, J. B., Schoenfeld, L. & Yohe, J. M., Rigorous computation and the zeros of the Riemann zeta-function. Invited paper, *Proceedings IFIP Congress 68*, pp. 13-18. Amsterdam: North Holland 1968.
- Rutledge, J. D., On Ianov's program schemata. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **11** (1964) 1-9.
- Rutledge, J. D., The problem of correct programming. Undated.
- Sanderson, J. G., A contribution to the theory of programming languages. Ph.D. Thesis. University of Adelaide 1966.
- Sanderson, J. G., The theory of programming languages - a survey. *Proceedings of the Third Australian Computer Conference 1966*, pp. 321-4. Chippendale, New South Wales: Australian Trade Publications Pty Ltd 1967.
- Sanderson, J. G., Mathematical models of programming languages. *J. Ass. comput. Mach.* (in press).
- Sauer, G., Remark on algorithm 268. *Comm. Ass. comput. Mach.*, **12** (1969) 407.

- Shirey, R. W., Implementation and analysis of efficient graph planarity testing algorithms. Ph.D. Thesis. University of Wisconsin 1969. Also *Computer Sciences Corporation Report* 1969.
- Slutz, D. R., The flow graph schemata model of parallel computation. Ph.D. Thesis. Massachusetts Institute of Technology 1968.
- Smirnov, Yu. I., O preobrazovanii operatornoy skhemy. *Zhurnal Vychislitel'noy Matematiki i Matematicheskoy Fiziki*, 3 (1963) No. 3. Moskva.
- Stark, R. H., On means to record algorithms to facilitate generation of error-free programs. *Computing Center Report* 68-1, Washington State University 1968.
- Thiele, H., Wissenschaftstheoretische Untersuchungen in Algorithmischen Sprachen, 1. Berlin: VEB Deutscher Verlag der Wissenschaften 1966.
- Thorelli, L. E., An algorithm for computing all paths in a graph, *B.I.T.*, 6 (1966) 347-9.
- Tobey, R. G., Rational function integration. Ph.D. Thesis. Harvard University 1967.
- Tonoyan, R. N., Logicheskie skhemy algoritmov i ikh zkvivalentnye preobrazovaniya. *Problemy Kibernetiki*, Vol. 14. Moskva: Izd-Vo Nauka 1964.
- Van Wijngaarden, A., Numerical analysis as an independent science, *B.I.T.*, 6(1966) 66-81.
- Van Wijngaarden, A., Mailloux, B. J., Peck, J. E. L. & Koster, C. H. A. (eds), Final draft report on the algorithmic language ALGOL 68. *Mathematisch Centrum Report MR 100*. Amsterdam 1968.
- Wagner, R. A., Some techniques for algorithm optimization with application to matrix arithmetic expressions. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1968.
- Waldinger, R. J. & Lee, R. C. T., PROW: A step toward automatic program writing. *Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pp. 241-52 (eds Walker, D. E. & Norton, L. M.). New York: A C M 1969.
- Walters, D. A., A representation system for parsing procedures. *RCA Laboratories Scientific Report No. 1*. 1968. Also Ph.D. Thesis. University of Pennsylvania 1968.
- Wirth, N., On certain basic concepts of programming languages. *Computer Science Technical Report No. CS65*. Stanford University 1967.
- Wood, D., A proof of Hamblin's algorithm for translation of arithmetic expressions from infix to postfix form. *B.I.T.*, 9 (1969) 59-68.
- Wood, D., The theory of left factored languages: Part 1. *Comput. J.*, 12 (1969) 349-56. Part 2 (in press).
- Yanov, Yu. I. See Ianov, Y. I.
- Yohe, J. M., Computer programming for accuracy. *Mathematics Research Center Technical Summary Report No. 866*. University of Wisconsin 1968.

APPENDIX

- Zama, N., On models of algorithms and flowcharts. *Commentarii Mathematici Universitatis Sancti Pauli*, **14** (1966) 123–34.
- Zama, N., On a generalization of algorithms and one of its applications (1). *Commentarii Mathematici Universitatis Sancti Pauli*, **15** (1967) 109–16.
- Zama, N., On some algebraic formulation of algorithms. *Commentarii Mathematici Universitatis Sancti Pauli*, **17** (1968) 53–62.
- Zaslavskii, I. D., Graph-schemes with memory. *Matematycheskogo Instuta Imeni V. A. Steklova*, LXXII, pp. 99–192 (Russian).

Added in proof

- Burstall, R. M., Formal description of program structure and semantics in first order logic. *Machine Intelligence 5*, pp. 79–98 (eds Meltzer, B. & Michie, D.). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1970.
- Engeler, E., Provability for programs. Unpublished 1969.
- Manna, Z., The correctness of non-deterministic programs. *Artificial Intelligence Memo No. 95*. Stanford University 1969.
- Ratray, C. M. I., Aspectos teoricos de la comprobacion de programas de ordenador. *Estudios Empresariales*, **13** (1969) 83–93.
- Waldinger, R. J., Constructing programs automatically using theorem proving. Ph.D. Thesis. Carnegie-Mellon University 1969.